
CITY OF SANTA CLARA



**HISTORICAL AND LANDMARKS COMMISSION
MEETING**

**March 1, 2007 - Thursday
City Manager's Staff Conference Room**

*****MINUTES***
7:00 P.M.**

ITEMS FOR COUNCIL ACTION

None

NOTE: Prior to the regularly scheduled meeting there was a Santa Clara BART Station Design Concepts Workshop/Comments Meeting from 6:30 p.m. to 7:00 p.m. Minutes/comments from this workshop are attached.

There will be a Joint Study Session with the Planning Commission on March 14, 2007 at 6:00 p.m. prior to their 7:00 p.m. meeting.

- I. Call to Order
Chairperson Richards called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m.
- II. Roll Call
Commissioners Boynton, Marinshaw, McKee, Patton, Richards and Wilson

Members Excused: Commissioner Petersen

Staff Present: Debby Fernandez, Assistant Planner II and Judith Silva, Associate Planner/Staff Liaison to HLC.

Guests Present: Eli Naor, Hessian Basra, Les Miller, Judy Tipton, Teresa Nemeth, Joan Cabral and Don Arnoldy.
- III. Requests for withdrawals and continuances without a hearing
None
- IV. Approval of Minutes
A. HLC Meeting Minutes of February 1, 2007

Motion: It was moved by Commissioner McKee, seconded by Commissioner Wilson and unanimously carried (Commissioner Petersen was excused) to note and file the minutes of February 1, 2007 as written.

- V. Items on this Agenda Requiring Council Action
The following items may be heard by the City Council upon a recommendation by the Historical and Landmarks Commission:
Agenda Item X.A. Mills Acts Criteria
- VI. Council and Planning Commission Actions Pertaining to the Historical and Landmarks Commission (Discussion as Needed)
Ms. Silva reviewed items of interest for the Commission.
- VII. Correspondence/Announcements
A. General Correspondence Distributed in Commission Packet
None
- VIII. Public Presentations
There were no public presentations.

IX. New Business (Revised)

A. Supplemental Environmental Impact Report (SEIR)- BART Station Design

-Review of Environmental Analysis for proposed relocation of historic structures (speeder shed and tower only) SEIR can be viewed at <http://www.vtabart-vta.org/seir.asp?area=SEIR>

Ms. Fernandez reviewed the Supplemental Environmental Impact Report (SEIR) – Bart Station Design for the Commission and distributed a summary and maps of the document. She stated the Historical and Landmarks Commission, as a CLG City, is being requested to comment on the *Cultural and Historic Resources* portion of the document. She noted there were two Areas of Potential Effects for the Project, one for archaeological resources and one for architectural resources. Ms. Fernandez noted the archaeological portion would be largely undetermined until test excavations are conducted.

She noted a 2006 historic resources report was prepared to supplement the 2002 report. The addendum report includes the inventory and evaluation of architectural resources within the areas of the revised alignment.

Ms. Fernandez noted that in the FEIR, the yard and shops facility in Santa Clara would be relocated from the San Jose/Santa Clara boundary line to De La Cruz Boulevard while noting the facility would begin north of the west tunnel portal at Newhall Street and extend to De La Cruz Boulevard, where a single tail track would go under the De La Cruz Boulevard overpass and terminate on the other side of the overpass. She noted the facility would be long and narrow, encompassing approximately 12 acres, and would be constructed on the former UPRR Newhall Yard (purchased by VTA in 2004). A total of 470 parking spaces are proposed for

employees, authorized visitors, and delivery and service vehicles in conjunction with a 3-4 level parking structure with approximately 1,700 parking spaces.

Ms. Fernandez provided an overview of the station campus and noted that the pedestrian connection to the Caltrain Station would require the relocation of the historic tower, utility shed and speeder shed, north of Benton Street approximately 30 feet south of the Santa Clara Station Depot, to maintain the historic relationship between the Tower, Sheds and Depot. The 3 – 4 level parking structure on the north end of the station area, north of Brokaw Road was reviewed, Ms. Fernandez informed the Commission that the SEIR includes the North Parking Garage Option only, and eliminates the South Parking Garage Option presented in the FEIR. Ms. Fernandez then noted that additional surface parking and/or future transit facilities would be located to the east within the Station area, as needed. Ms. Fernandez further noted that access to the Santa Clara Station area would be from Brokaw Road off Coleman Avenue.

Ms. Fernandez informed the Commission that the SEIR includes a “No Parking at Diridon/Arena Station” option and provides an analysis of the traffic impacts associated with this alternative. Ms. Fernandez explained that the No Parking Option would require the provision of 900 additional parking spaces at the Santa Clara BART Station, for a total of 2,600 parking spaces. This Option would increase the height of the proposed parking structure from 3-4 stories to 5-6 stories.

The following comments were received from the Commission and others in attendance:

- Don Arnoldy stated his concerns regarding lack of parking in San Jose and how it might affect Santa Clara and questioned rationale for removing parking at the Diridon Station.
- Chairperson Richards stated he did not think BART and transit would be helpful to the Old Quad and historic properties.

X. Old Business, Referrals and Continued Items

A. Mills Act Criteria – Interior Changes, Inspections and other

Ms. Silva noted a short memo had been prepared by staff citing questions that have come up recently, which include inspections; interior changes; and conversions of attic and basement areas as to whether they are included in the maximum 25 percent addition ruling.

Chairperson Richards stated he had reviewed State guidelines for Mills Act properties. He stated he felt that basement conversions that do not change the heights or structures should not be included in the 25 percent additions ruling, while noting that attic additions when done well do not change the look of a structure. The Chairperson also noted property owners should live up to their contracts and preservation plans.

Commissioner Wilson stated she felt additions should not exceed the 25 percent ruling in order to enter into a Mills Act Contract.

Ms. Silva noted that staff could take good photo documentation of the interior's of the properties, while noting the granting of a Mills Act Contract is a discretionary action. She then offered to obtain information from other cities' criteria for Mills Act properties.

Commissioner Marinshaw noted the public views historic properties from the outside, not the inside.

Commissioner Boynton spoke on the merits of preserving the streetscapes and stated he favored staying with the 25 percent ruling in order to qualify for a Mills Act Contract and that additions not exceed more than 25 percent of the total square footage of the original structure.

Commissioner Patton stated she felt the 25 percent rule was appropriate and that Mills Act Contracts should be reviewed on a case-by-case basis. She noted she did not feel changes to attic and basement areas should be included in the 25 percent additions ruling, while noting contracts are discretionary, not an entitlement.

Commissioner Wilson stated schools suffer with reductions in property taxes and rules should be in place.

Commissioner McKee requested staff make findings for the Commission and provide good photo documentation.

Staff was requested to survey other cities for their Mills Act Contracts criteria.

Chairperson Richards requested input from the Director of Planning and Inspection regarding Mills Act Contracts and the criteria for granting them.

XI. Commissioner/Committee Reports

A. Santa Clara Arts and Historic Consortium (McKee)

[Fourth Monday of each month at 7:15 p.m. - Headmen-Inman House]

Commissioner McKee noted there would be a Walk in the Park and noted other internal affairs taking place.

B. Historic Preservation Society of Santa Clara (Richards/Marinshaw alternate)

[Second Friday of each month at 10:00 a.m.- Harris Lass Preserve]

Chairperson Richards advised those present that there would be a bicycle tour on Father's Day, the annual Tea and a Garden Tour with the women's Club in May.

C. Old Quad Residents Association (Richards/McKee alternate)

There was no meeting and no report.

D. Neighborhood University Relations (Petersen)

There was no report.

E. Architectural Committee (Marinshaw/Patton)

There was no report or items related to the Commission.

F. Agnews Historic Cemetery Museum Committee (Wilson and Patton)

Ms. Silva noted there would be a Committee meeting on March 2 at Pete's Coffee in River mark. Commissioners Patton and Wilson noted they were both unable to attend. Ms. Silva advised the Commission that Larry Wolfe, Director of Parks and Recreation will follow-up with staff.

XII. Items Considered, Time Permitting

XIII. A. Commission Budget for 2006-07

There was no report.

XIV. Pending Agenda Items (notice of upcoming agenda items only- No discussion)

A. Commemorative plaque for the Verein (this item has been forwarded to Santa Clara University). Joe Sugg/SCU to install plaque when construction is completed, est. date Fall 2006).

B. Commissioner Training

C. Further updates on Harris-Lass Preserve

D. BART Station Design Workshop Notice

XV. Adjournment

As there was no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 8:50 p.m. in honor of Florence Parle who passed away today, March 1, 2007.

Respectfully submitted:

Approved:

Judith Silva
Associate Planner/HLC Staff Liaison

Gloria Sciara, AICP
Interim Manager of Development Review/
Historic Resources Coordinator

I:\PLANNING\2007\HLC 2007\0301\min 030107.rtf

Minutes and Comments from the Santa Clara BART Station Design Concepts Workshop/Comments Meeting from 6:30 p.m. to 7:00 p.m.

Debby Fernandez introduced the VTA team and architect, Eli Naor. Ms. Fernandez noted there had been meetings, including the Community Working Group and Planning Commission in coming up with the contextual design for the station architecture.

Eli Naor then addressed the Commission and complemented Planning staff for their time and ideas. He noted that what was before the Historical and Landmarks Commission was a collaborative effort. He showed aerials and slides while reviewing the multi-modal transit station, noting that by the year 2030 there would be an estimated 20,000 persons a day using this facility.

Ms. Fernandez then requested the Commission's comments on the two architectural designs presented, while noting they are a work in progress.

Mr. Naor noted one of the designs (Option 1) was very modern interpretation of a terminus station with a linear transparent form and angular appearance; while the other design (Option 2) is a contemporary interpretation of the older traditional train stations found in Europe and the East Coast with exposed steel trusses and ceilings. Mr. Naor noted that Option Alternative 2 is reflective of the historic Santa Clara Railroad Station in a modern form with a copper toned metal roof, reminiscent of the mission tile roofs of the early mission period. He then reviewed the etched glass wall facing the west side of the station and noted the visual images that would be etched into the glass to illustrate Santa Clara's historic past, noting that the glass would be illuminated at night. Mr. Naor then elaborated on the pedestrian bridge and viewing platform extending from the bridge and looking westward to showcase the community. Mr. Naor closed the discussion with responses to questions by the Commission regarding energy efficiency, relocation of the historic tower and sheds, ADA and bicycle access, and connectivity from BART to the existing Caltrain station/historic depot.

The Commission's comments were as follows:

Commissioner Boynton: Impressive and well thought-out. Preferred Option 2

Commissioner Wilson: Liked the etched glass feature facing west and preferred the Option 2 design.

Commissioner Marinshaw: Liked the modern interpretation and Preferred Option 1. Asked that it be energy efficient.

Chairperson Richards: Did not feel that the form and materials are compatible with the historic depot. Stated that the design is not consistent with historic preservation and would overwhelm the historic station. He suggested a design more reflective of those in California or the East Coast that reflect earlier periods. He also suggested the profile is too massive and should be lowered, maybe even underground.

Commissioner McKee: Questioned how this benefits the community.

Commissioner Patton: Liked the etched glass feature facing west. Stated she was excited to get BART to Santa Clara and suggested a more Spanish design, similar to the Santa Barbara station.

By consensus, the Commission favored Design Option 2 which they felt better reflects older train stations and is more compatible with the historic depot.